

Participant Committee Review (Input from Nepal)

MADAGASCAR R-PP

Overall assessment: Fairly well written R-PP

MADAGASCAR R-PP		
Section	Assessment	Recommendation
1a National Readiness Management Arrangement.	Three level of structures proposed: (i) Multi stakeholder National REDD Readiness Coordination Platform; (ii) Operational Office and; (iii) REDD executive secretariat (professional individuals hired for the REDD readiness Period)	In order to have strong linkages and coordination with the operational office and the platform it would better to head the executive secretariat by qualifies government employee. The role of monitoring and technical validation would be better to assign for operational office rather than the executive secretariat.
1b Stakeholder consultation and Participation	Consultations were made through meetings, seminars, workshops at local, regional, and national levels,; direct discussions with people in the field; and broadcasting debates in radio and television. Not much consultations was made at the filed level with beneficiaries	Consider adjusting plan for wide consultation and involvement of stakeholders, specially the real forest dependent people. Adjust plan for capacity building of local indigenous and forest dependent people. Consider preparing extension material in simple and local language. Identify effective means of communication keeping in mind the present level of understanding of local stakeholders.
Component 2 2a assessment of Land Use, Forest Policy and	The proximate and underlying causes of deforestation and degradation are well documented but not specific to particular region. Legal and illegal trade, commercial housing and construction are grouped together as a direct cause of forest degradation and named as	Consider identifying drivers of DD for protected area and other forest category by region.

Governance	"Forestry" . Weak governance, corruptions are also listed as the underlying causes of DD	
2b REDD strategy options	Optimizing agricultural production, reduce population growth in the forest area, enhancement of forest tenure security, reinforce fire management, increase wood production, reduce wood consumption enhancement in the management of protected area system and enhancement of better administration are the major eight strategies proposed in the R-PP.	Consider developing strategies for (i) minimizing DD from infrastructure development; and (ii) institutional reform for minimizing/control corruption and effective coordination
2c REDD implementation framework	In the existing situation, the national government is viewed as the owner of the carbon. Due to tenure uncertainty the ownership of carbon of the private forest is not clear. Options for national, sub national and hybrid of national and sub national participation in transactions on emission reduction is properly discussed. Carbon tax and allocation and sharing of revenue generated are also well discussed.	Being a centralized country, sub national or hybrid system could not be appropriate for Madagascar. Carry out in depth study and discussions on REDD fund management and REDD implementation (national/sub national or hybrid level).
2d Social and environmental Impacts	Analysis of present strategy for social and environmental impacts and gap identification	Consider analyzing the present strategy and what need to be done for REDD implementation. Based on this gap analysis, present proposal for fulfilling the gaps for SESA strategic options and Environmental and Social Management Framework.
Component 3	Presentation of a number of steps to estimate historic emission based on the available data. Provision for the development of national reference is clear	Identify gaps based on the available data and new data need and prescribe methods on how to collect the required data.
Component 4	Madagascar proposes various activities for designing monitoring system. One of the activities proposed is identification and hiring of a coordinator for the design phase of MRV.	Instead of hiring coordinator for the RPP period, it would be better to coordinate by the existing institution (if available).